and that he means to take him out secretly and give him safely back to his father. But meanwhile Joseph is stolen by Midianites instead of having been sold to them, and when Reuben returns he finds to his despair that Joseph is gone. See the contradiction? The J story has Judah, the E story has Reuben. In the J story, Judah persuades them to sell him; in the E story Reuben persuades them not to kill but to put him in the empty cistern from which he intends to take him out and then when he comes back he finds that he is gone. As the alleged two accounts now stand together, both of them are part of one story. Is there a contradiction between them? One point where there is an alleged contradiction is that Judah persuades them to sell him to a caravan of Ishmaelites, while according to the other story, Joseph is stolen by Midianites. One says Midianites and one says Ishmaelites. In one case he was stolen; in the other case they sold him.

Student: Where do they get it that they stole him?

AAM: That is a very good question. It is a little hard to follow Addis here, because he seems to change the text slightly at times. But I am going to look at it in the English here. This is chapter 37, verse 28, "Then there passed by Midianite merchantmen and they drew and lifted up Joseph out of the pit, and sold Joseph to the Ishmaelites for twenty pieces of silver and they brought Joseph into Egypt." That is the Authorized Version as it stands, but according to Addis, the first verse, "And there passed by Midianite merchantmen, and they drew" is from the E document. They drew, and Addis puts Joseph in brackets, out of the cistern. They stole him. Whereas the J document starts right there - "and lifted up Joseph up out of the pit," that is, his brothers lifted him up out of the pit and sold Joseph to the Ishmaelites for twenty pieces of silver - "And they brought Joseph into Egypt." According to the E document, it just says, "they stole him"; he was just stolen and then after awhile, all of a sudden, he turns up in Egypt. But in the J document Addis considered verse 36 as part of the J document. (Verse 36 says the Midianites sold him into Egypt.) He must surely have a mistake there because he considers verse 28, which speaks about the Ishmaelites as being from the E document. You see, though, how he gets the contradiction here. He takes half a verse apart from the rest and it says they drew - he says it means "they stole