

really part of the argument on the place of sacrifice, that at the time of Josiah there was a change to provide cities of refuge, to make it possible for people to have a substitute for what the altar had provided for them. I am going to skim over very hastily the arguments that Carpenter gives about these religious institutions on page 82. Some of those mentioned are much more important than others. First, he says J and E have sacrifice by the heads of families. They can perform sacrifices, and they can do this at any place where God appears. We have Abram coming into the land, he is the head of the family, he sacrifices here and there and elsewhere, but usually he builds an altar establishing a place. It was not just anywhere. But, they say, “in P you do not have any record of sacrifice by heads of families before the time of Moses, nor do you have any record in P of sacrifice being here and there and wherever.” That is an undeniable fact, because the critics assign to J and E all the places that mention sacrifice before the time of Moses. They are narrative – not tabulation, nor lists – so of course, P has no sacrifice before God established it. It seems rather peculiar that they would seriously give this argument, because, after all, according to their conception of P (if there was such a thing) surely P would not think that sacrifice just began out of nothing at Sinai and that before that there never was any sacrifice – it is just unbelievable that the P writers would ever have thought such a thing. If sacrifice was as vital as they considered it to be, and if they included their long lists of rules of sacrifice, then the P writers certainly would have considered that at the time of Abraham there would have been some kind of sacrifice. But they put all the accounts of sacrifice in J and E, and then say that P never mentions pre-Mosaic sacrifice. But there is no occasion for it to do so. Sacrifice does not enter into enumerations and lists.

Then, concerning the place of sacrifice, we are told that J and E allow sacrifice anywhere that God appears, but that D has sacrifice forbidden except at that one place that God designates, and that P *assumes* sacrifice at only one place. You should notice how, in most of these cases, the claim that there is progress between the documents boils down to where it is actually only in two documents that they claim to find progress! P does not *say* anything about sacrificing at one place, but they say that P *assumes* sacrifice at one place. It just