

1960
Sterling Dow, "The Greeks in the Bronze Age" (in Lang. & Background of Homer, Kirk)

p. 159 The Catalogue of Ships, however doubtful its division of the Argolid into two, may well echo historical truth in not making the relation (not, of course, the absolute figures) of Agamemnon's naval power to the rest of Greece resemble that of Athens later. + ?

p. 172 The problem is made far more difficult if the Catalogue of Ships, which ostensibly shows that the threat to Mykenai became in fact a reality, is believed: the most recent treatment is Page, *HatHI* 129-132 and notes. On this point the governing consideration is surely that the state of Mykenai, with commerce reaching out far to the east as well as to the west, is represented as faced by coalition of the Argolid at its very threshold, between Mykenai and the sea . . . This is the most important single crux in the Catalogue: whatever the consequences, the Catalogue must be pronounced completely and absolutely in error. Some details of cities and men were seemingly preserved correctly in the tradition, but the poets were not political historians; they needed cities for Diomedes, and recklessly they gave him the nearest. It is yet another instance of the whimsical, but perhaps intelligible, inaccuracy of epic poetry. - + -

1960
G.S. Kirk, "Objective Dating Criteria in Homer" (in Lang. & Bkgrnd. of Homer, Kirk)

Dow's Thesis
p. 175 Thus boar's-tusk helmets could conceivably have survived physically, say, the late 11th century B.C., to have been described then by an archaizing poet - though this is not particularly probable; even the body-shields, apparently obsolete even in the last two centuries of Mycenae, could conceivably have survived in pictures ~~in pictures~~ or in martial memory or by a combination of the two; the many myths which Nilsson showed in "The Mycenaean Origin of Greek Mythology" to have had an original Bronze-Age setting could have been passed down in unversified narrative; but much of the substance of the Catalogue of Achaean Contingents in the second book of the *Iliad*, which gives a complex and largely accurate survey of the Mycenaean geography disputed by the Dorian movement, can hardly have been compiled more than a generation or so later than the final upheaval and must have been very soon committed to a fixed form, which means poetry.

Jas. A. Notopoulos, "Studies in Early Greek Oral Poetry" (In *Harvard Studies in Classical Philology*, Vol. 68) 1964

p. 24 In the Catalogue of Ships, in the section dealing with the cities in the Pylos district, Homer inserts a valuable piece of information on the bard Thamyris: . . .

n Since this passage comes from the Catalogue of Ships, the most historically authentic Mycenaean document in the *Iliad*, as Page and others have shown, Thamyris of Thrace, which we know to be connected with Orpheus, is our first historical bard in the Mycenaean tradition, and Thrace and Pylos are our earliest fixed centers in the oral atlas +

Thos. Day Seymour, Life in the Homeric Age (New York: Biblio & Tannen) 1907

p. 65 The relation of the Catalogue to the rest of the *Iliad*, however, is not clear, and certainly no violence should be used to bring the rest of the poems into harmony with this document. More discrepancies exist between it and the story of the battles than between any other parts of the poems. -