

Page 63 (Chapter IV - Homer)

This is the famous Homeric Question which scholars have debated for a century and a half: the reader will not expect it to be settled here. The later Greeks themselves possessed a whole cycle of epics on the Trojan war. Two of these were of surpassing excellence, and were attributed to Homer. This attribution was accepted quite wholeheartedly until modern times when closer investigation showed all sorts of discrepancies of fact, style and language both between the two epics and between various parts of each. The immediate result of this was the minute and confident division of the two poems, but especially of the Iliad, into separate lays of different periods, appropriately called 'strata' by critics who sometimes imperfectly distinguished between artistic and geological composition. The study of the epic poetry of other races, and of the methods used by poets working in this traditional medium, has done a great deal to restore confidence in the substantial unity of each poem: that is to say, that what we have in each case is not a short poem by one original 'Homer' to which later poets have added more or less indiscriminately, but a poem conceived as a unity by a relatively late 'Homer' who worked over and incorporated much traditional material--though the present Iliad certainly contains some passages which were not parts of 'Homer's' design. Whether the same poet wrote both poems is a point on which opinions differ and probably always will. The difference in tone and in treatment is great. Longinus, the finest critic of antiquity, observed this, and remarked, 'Homer in the Odyssey is like the setting sun; the grandeur remains, but not the intensity'. It may be the same sun. But a man has a right to an opinion who has immersed himself in Homer to the extent of translating one of the poems. Accordingly, it is interesting to observe that of the two recent English translators, T. E. Lawrence is so certain that the two poets are not the same that he does not even consider the possibility: while Mr. E. V. Rieu says, 'His readers may feel as sure that they are in one man's hands as they do when they turn to As You Like It after reading King John'.